Bolsover District Council

Audit Committee

21st November 2016

Self Evaluation of the Role and Effectiveness of the Audit Committee

Report of the Executive Director Operations

This report is public

Purpose of the Report

 To facilitate Members of the Audit Committee undertaking a selfassessment of the operation of the Committee to enable them to form a view as to the effectiveness of the Committee and to agree any actions which are necessary in order to improve such effectiveness.

1 Report Details

- 1.1 The Audit Committee plays a key role in the governance arrangements of all local authorities. As such an effective Audit Committee is crucial to secure the effective operation of governance arrangements within the Council. Given the importance of the Committee's role it is crucial that the Committee gives regular consideration to its effectiveness in practice.
- 1.2 In order to evaluate the effectiveness of the Committee this report sets out the criteria agreed by CIPFA / SOLACE as being appropriate benchmarks against which to measure the performance of an Audit Committee. These are attached as **Appendix 1** to this report and will be discussed by the Committee at the meeting in order to arrive at a self evaluation. This exercise is now undertaken on an annual basis.

2 Conclusions and Reasons for Recommendation

2.1 To enable that the Audit Committee to undertake a structured self assessment of its effectiveness.

3 Consultation and Equality Impact

3.1 There are no issues arising directly from this report.

4 Alternative Options and Reasons for Rejection

4.1 Given its role in ensuring the effective operation of the Council it is appropriate that the Audit Committee undertakes a regular self-assessment of its performance. The main alternative of not undertaking a self assessment is therefore rejected.

5 **Implications**

5.1 **Finance and Risk Implications**

There are no issues arising directly from this report.

5.2 <u>Legal Implications including Data Protection</u>

There are no issues arising directly from this report.

5.3 **Human Resources Implications**

There are no issues arising directly from this report.

6 Recommendations

6.1 That the Audit Committee undertake a self assessment concerning the effectiveness of its performance against the criteria established by CIPFA/SOLACE.

7 <u>Decision Information</u>

Is the decision a Key Decision?	No
(A Key Decision is one which results in income or	
expenditure to the Council of £50,000 or more or	
which has a significant impact on two or more	
District wards)	
District Wards Affected	Not Directly
Links to Corporate Plan priorities or Policy	All
Framework	

8 <u>Document Information</u>

Appendix No	Title		
1	Questions for Audit Committee Members to Ask: Governance – Extracted from CIPFA / SOLACE: Delivering Good Governance in Local Government (2012)		
	Background Papers (These are unpublished works which have been relied on to a material extent when preparing the report. They must be listed in the section		

a material extent when preparing the report. They must be listed in the section below. If the report is going to Cabinet (NEDDC) or Executive (BDC) you must provide copies of the background papers)

Report Author	Contact Number
Bryan Mason	01246 242431
Executive Director Operations	

<u>Questions for Audit Committee Members to Ask: Governance – Extracted from CIPFA / SOLACE: Delivering Good Governance in Local Government (2012)</u>

The self assessment concerning the operation of the Audit Committee will be undertaken against the criteria set out in the above publication. In order to assist Members in developing a view these criteria are set out below.

The assessment covers the six principles of good governance.

To assist the Committee the Executive Director – Operations (Chief Financial Officer) has provided comments in response to the issues raised by CIPFA / SOLACE. These comments are intended to demonstrate why it could be considered that appropriate arrangements are in place. It is for the Committee to take a view as to the appropriateness of these comments and to conclude whether existing arrangements are satisfactory.

1 Good governance means focusing on the purpose of the authority and on outcomes for the community and creating and implementing a vision for the local area.

Does the inter	nal audit strategy ı	meet our needs?		
The Head of the Internal Audit Consortium produces an Internal Audit Plan at the outset of each financial year and provides formal monitoring reports concerning progress against that plan at regular intervals during the course of the year. The Audit Committee formally approves the Audit Plan and it is agreed by both External Audit and the Director of Operations (S151 Officer).				
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.	

Are the author	ity's key risks still	relevant to the cur	rent strategic objectives?
These are kept under review in the preparation of the Plan. Internal Audit have access to both Members / Officers and to all key Council reports, performance and financial data and therefore are in an appropriate position to ensure that the report reflects changing risks.			
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

2 Good governance means members and officers working together to achieve a common purpose with clearly defined functions and roles.

	nal audit reporting ht and attention?	line ensure that au	udit recommendations are	
the Audit Comm	The Audit Committee and SAMT consider the outcome of all internal audit reports, with the Audit Committee receiving a copy of all reports that are marginal or unsatisfactory. The implementation of agreed recommendations is formally monitored through the			
•	mance Manageme		nally monitored through the	
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
improvement place.				

How are extern auditors?	al auditors co-ord	linating their work	with the authority's internal
External and Inte	ernal Audit underta	ke such liaison as th	ey consider to be appropriate.
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

Is a common de	efinition of risk us	ed across the auth	nority?
The authority has a Risk Management Strategy which is applied across the authority; this Strategy has recently been updated (January 2016), with training provided for both Officers and Members.			
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

3 Good governance means promoting values for the authority and demonstrating the values of good governance through upholding high standards of conduct and behaviour

Are the internal auditors free from any other responsibilities that could impair their independence?

The Chief Financial Officer is of the view that this requirement is met by the Council, and that Internal Audit have no routine managerial duties. It should be noted that the Internal Audit service is delivered by a consortium arrangement hosted by Chesterfield Borough Council.

Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of improvement	appropriate arrangements in place.

Are procedures followed consistently with the need to achieve value for money? The Council is actively promoting a culture based upon effective performance management and robust budgetary control. When these are applied against a background of an on-going reduction in the level of financial resources available then these will provide powerful incentives to securing VFM. 4. Fully 3. Arrangements in need of appropriate arrangements in improvement place.

What steps are being taken to discharge the duty to promote and maintain high standards of conduct?				
	This is assessed as part of the process of preparing the Annual Governance Statement and that assessment was outlined in a report to the May 2016 meeting.			
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
		improvement	place.	

4 Good governance means taking informed and transparent decisions which are subject to effective scrutiny and managing risk

Do internal and	l external auditors	receive the neces	sary degree of co-operation?	
In the view of the Executive Director Operations the necessary degree of co-operation has been provided. He is not aware of any issues where appropriate co-operation has not been provided. Internal Audit have extensive powers of access granted under the Council's Constitution, together with a right to report independently to both senior Officers and this Committee. The External Auditors would comment on any such failings through their communications with the Council.				
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
improvement place.				

Where internal audit budgets are being reduced, how will the level of assurance be maintained?

While Internal Audit budgets have been reduced careful consideration has been given to the risks faced by the Council and the level of resource (audit days) within the Audit Plan has been benchmarked against the Plans of other similar local authorities. Internal Audit has recently been subject to an independent external assessment the outcomes of which will be reported to the next meeting of this Committee.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

Have there been any attempts to restrict the scope of the internal auditors' work in any way? Not in the opinion of the Chief Financial officer. The Head of the Internal Audit Consortium would have a responsibility to report any such concerns. 4. Fully Compliant 3. Arrangements in need of appropriate arrangements in place.

How is the efficiency and effectiveness of internal audit demonstrated?

The Audit Committee receives regular reports which should put it in a position to reach an informed view. The Chief Financial Officer provides a report to the Audit Committee on an annual basis which assesses the effectiveness of internal audit. The report relating to 2015/16 was considered at the 16th May 2016 meeting of this Committee. Internal Audit has recently been subject to an independent external assessment the outcomes of which will be reported to the next meeting of this Committee.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

Do the internal or external auditors have any concerns about management's control awareness or operating style?

Any such concerns will be raised as part of their routine reporting process. Both internal and external audit are aware of their right to report any concerns to the Audit Committee, or to any member of the Senior Management Team.

or to arry mornior or the corner management ream.				
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	

		improvement	place.		
Does the audit committee have all the assurances it needs to meet its responsibilities and ensure the authority meets its statutory duties?					
line with statutor report and self-a	The Chief Financial Officer seeks to ensure that the Authority's business is conducted in line with statutory duties and good practice. One of the intended outcomes from this report and self-assessment is that the Audit Committee should consider its role in the organisation and whether it undertakes its functions effectively.				
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have		
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in		
		improvement	place.		

Is there effective assurance across all key areas?					
The Annual Governance Report, this self-assessment, the reports of External and Internal Audit should inform the Audit Committees views on this matter.					
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.		

Is the audit committee over-reliant on internal and external audit for assurance? Are there other sources of assurance that should be considered? The Annual Governance Statement – including supporting papers – together with this self-assessment should enable the Audit Committee to give appropriate consideration to this issue. 4. Fully Compliant 3. Arrangements fit for purpose in need of improvement in place.

Have all staff had the opportunity to contribute to identifying the risks the authority faces?

Service Plans which are provided by all sections incorporate a Service Risk Register which needs to be agreed by the teams themselves. The Quarterly Finance, Performance and Risk meetings provide an opportunity to input into and influence both Service and Strategic Risk Registers.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

All reports to Committee include a section on risk, projects have Risk Registers and management processes highlight the importance of giving appropriate consideration to Risk. Senior Officers have received refresher training in respect of Risk and it is a standing item on the Quarterly Performance Management meetings. 4. Fully 3. Arrangements 2. Arrangements in need of appropriate arrangements in

improvement

place.

ls risk manaç	gement integrated w	rith the authority's	other procedures?
	ered alongside Perfo Management framew		e as part of the Council's
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

Are appropriate procedures in place to ensure adequate user involvement in the development of new systems and major systems changes, including the design of control checks and balances?

All projects are managed through a project group which includes representatives of all stakeholders.

4. Fully

Compliant

3. Arrangements
in need of appropriate arrangements in place.

Has the authority implemented national counter-fraud standards?				
the Executive Di	The Audit Committee receives updates on this issue from the Internal Audit Team and the Executive Director – Operations, which seek to demonstrate that the authority is complying with national standards.			
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	

Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of improvement	appropriate arrangements in place.

5 Good governance means developing the capacity and capability of members and officers to be effective

Are there appropriate training and induction procedures for audit committee

members?

t is appropriate that the Audit Committee comes to its own view on this issue. This eport is part of a wider programme of developing self awareness within the Committee.				
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
•	· ·	improvement	place.	
		' 	•	
Does the audit	committee period	ically assess its ov	vn effectiveness?	
This report / prod	cess is intended to	secure that objective	e. It is intended that an	
			vill be brought back to Audit	
Committee on ar	n annual basis.			
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
		improvement	place.	
			professional knowledge and	
•	experience to ensure that audits are performed to appropriate professional			
standards? Is there sufficient systems expertise to deal with the level of technology used by the authority?				
technology used by the authority:				
The Executive D	irector presented a	report to the May m	neeting of this Committee	
			al Audit which concluded that the	
		Audit Committee has	a significant level of contact with	
, ,	•	•		
Compliant	tit for purpose			
		improvement	place.	
The Executive D providing his ass	irector presented a sessment of the effective one. The A	report to the May mectiveness of Interna		

Does the autho	rity run training s	essions on risk ma	magement for new stant?	
management is a specification whi appointed. When	a significant part of ch will ensure that e necessary appro	any role it will be incoming suitably experied priate training will be		
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
		improvement	place.	
			Statement on the Role of the here any issues to address?	
This was underta	aken as part of the	process of preparing	g the Annual Governance	
Statement which	concluded the aut	hority was fully com	pliant. Copies of the CIPFA	
Statement can b	e provided on requ	iest.		
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
·		improvement	place.	
			Statement on the Role of the ons? Are there any issues to	
Statement which	•	hority was fully com	g the Annual Governance pliant. Copies of the CIPFA	
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have	
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in	
		improvement	place.	
_	Good governance means engaging with local people and other stakeholders to ensure robust local public accountability			

Does the authority's annual governance statement reflect reality?

The Chief Financial Officer is of the view that is based upon an appropriate assessment which took account of any relevant sources of information. The Annual Governance Statement has been subject to consideration by the Audit Committee, by the Senior Alliance Management Team, by Internal Audit and by External Audit (KPMG). This should ensure effective scrutiny of the contents.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

The Annual Governance Statement is subject to consideration by the Audit Committee, by the Strategic Alliance Management Team and by External Audit (KPMG). This should ensure effective scrutiny of the contents. 4. Fully Compliant 3. Arrangements fit for purpose fit for purpose in need of improvement place.

Are there areas where the authority does not comply with relevant guidance? Not to the knowledge of the Chief Financial Officer. Should such areas be identified then the authority will either move to ensure compliance or will report such noncompliance appropriately. 4. Fully Compliant 3. Arrangements in need of appropriate arrangements in place.

	imstances prevent a accounts? Did any	•	greed timetable for preparing audit overrun?
The Council h requirements.		ared its accounts in I	ine with statutory / audit
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

Do the authority's financial statements satisfy all statutory and regulatory disclosure requirements to which the authority is subject?

Officers will take appropriate steps to ensure that the Council remains fully compliant. The work of officers will be subject to independent External Audit and subject to Member and Audit Committee scrutiny. The accounts themselves are a public document which is fully accessible for wider public scrutiny.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.
		-	

7 Ensuring Effectiveness

For audit committees to be effective, they should have:

Clear, distinct and up-to-date terms of reference.

The Terms of Reference are set out in the Council's Constitution which are reviewed on a regular basis. The relevant section of the Constitution sets out the role of the Audit Committee as follows:

AUDIT COMMITTEE

1. Statement of Purpose

The purpose of the Audit Committee is to provide independent assurance of the adequacy of the risk management framework and the associated control environment, independent scrutiny of the Authority's financial and non financial performance to the extent that it affects the Authority's exposure to risk and weakens the control environment. The Audit Committee will also oversee the Authority's corporate governance arrangements.

2. Reporting Framework

The Audit Committee will report directly to the Council, and provide information to the Executive for action, whilst maintaining its independence.

3. Membership and Structure of Meetings

The Audit Committee will have a membership of six plus one co-opted member and reflect the political composition of the Council. A quorum will constitute at least three members of the Committee. The Chair and Vice Chair of the Committee will be elected from its membership. The Chair and the Vice Chair of the Committee will be elected from its Membership. The Audit Committee will meet at least four times per year.

4. Principal Responsibilities

- (1) To ensure that the Council has a sound system of internal control which facilitates the effective exercise of the Council's functions to include the following:-
- i) Arrangements for the assessment and management of risk within the Authority and ensuring they are embedded within the organisation.
- ii) Approving and modifying the terms of reference and strategy for internal audit.
- iii) Receiving and approving the annual internal audit plan and reviewing the external audit plan.
- iv) Receiving quarterly reports on the progress against the annual audit plan.
- v) Reviewing and adopting the Annual Governance Statement.
- vi) Reviewing the Council's anti-fraud policy.
- (2) To consider the Council's Code of Corporate Governance and approve the annual statement in that respect.

- (3) To consider the External Auditors findings from their review of the Statement of Accounts.
- (4) To consider and approve, after review by External Audit, if the review is available, the Statement of Accounts and report such to Council. The date by which this must be achieved is 30th September each year.
- (5) To review and adopt the detailed and summary Annual Governance Statement in light of the Internal Audit Annual review, report on the effectiveness of Internal Audit, Governance letters and the financial details shown in the statement of Accounts. In addition when these items are scheduled for consideration the Leader, Deputy Leader and the appropriate Cabinet member would be invited to attend the Audit Committee and participate in the debate and discussion, but no voting rights would be associated with the invitation.
- (6) To review the Council's internal audit function and monitor performance.
- (7) To monitor and ensure implementation of internal and external audit recommendations.
- (8) To be responsible for ensuring effective scrutiny of the treasury management strategy and policies.

4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

An appropriate place within the governance structure of the authority and effective reporting arrangements.

The Audit Committee should consider this issue in the light of the Council's Constitution. The reporting framework as established by the Constitution is as follows: "The Audit Committee will report directly to the Council, and provide information to the Executive for action, whilst maintaining its independence."

4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

Members that are fully aware of their role, appropriately trained and independent minded.

This self-assessment should help ensure that Members are fully aware of their role. The Audit Committee itself will need to form a view as to the other issues raised by this question.

4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in
		improvement	place.

A skilled chair	supported by mer	nhers with financia	al and audit expertise		
A Skilled Chair	A skilled chair supported by members with financial and audit expertise.				
Audit Committee Members are selected on the basis that they have appropriate skills and experience. Ultimately the Audit Committee itself will need to form a view as to the					
	sed by this question				
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have		
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of improvement	appropriate arrangements in place.		
	balance of experts responsibilities.	ise, experience, co	ontinuity and political neutrality		
		Ultimately, however issues raised by this			
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have		
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in		
		improvement	place.		
Officer support	(including a secr	etary role).			
			cer, Internal Audit and by the		
		ttend where approp			
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have		
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in		
		improvement	place.		
A clearly set out and agreed (but flexible) annual work plan.					
The Audit Committee undertakes an annual work plan with its agenda determined by the wider financial and governance timetables that are operational within the Council.					
4. Fully	3.Arrangements	2. Arrangements	1.Council does not have		
Compliant	fit for purpose	in need of	appropriate arrangements in		
		improvement	place.		

A wide-ranging agenda that reflects the governance, risk and control priorities of the authority. The Audit Committee is structured around a consideration of key reports on Finance and Risk which are prepared for the 'Executive'. It has a Key Issues of Financial Governance report at every meeting which allows it to monitor progress against underlying Governance issues facing the Council. 2. Arrangements 4. Fully 3.Arrangements 1.Council does not have Compliant fit for purpose in need of appropriate arrangements in improvement place. Access to other committees/information as required. The Committee's rights are set out in the Constitution and it can require that it receives information which it considers to be appropriate to the conduct of its business. 4. Fully 3.Arrangements 2. Arrangements 1. Council does not have Compliant fit for purpose in need of appropriate arrangements in improvement place. Agenda papers circulated well in advance of the meetings. The aim is to ensure that all reports are circulated at least 5 working days before the meeting. 4. Fully 1.Council does not have 3.Arrangements 2. Arrangements Compliant fit for purpose in need of appropriate arrangements in improvement place. Meetings arranged on a regular basis. The Committee has approximately 6 meetings a year which are spread throughout the year. 4. Fully 3.Arrangements 2. Arrangements 1.Council does not have Compliant fit for purpose in need of appropriate arrangements in improvement place.

Engagement with a wide range of services in accordance with the risks under review.			
Executive Members, Directors and other officers may be requested to attend meetings as required.			
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.

Regular assessment of performance as a committee.			
This report is intended to secure that objective. It is intended that an appropriately updated version of this report will be brought back to Audit Committee on an annual basis in line with the reporting of the Annual Governance Statement.			
4. Fully Compliant	3.Arrangements fit for purpose	2. Arrangements in need of improvement	1.Council does not have appropriate arrangements in place.